

THE HUMAN PERSON: CONTEMPORARY THEOLOGY AND THE EXERCISES

By ANNICE CALLAHAN

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA'S BURNING desire to 'help souls' sprang from his personal encounter with God which he had experienced during his illness in Loyola and then during his time as a hermit at Manresa. God's forgiving nearness had freed him and he longed for others to be free in the freedom of God. Ignatius' experience of God and reflection on that experience impelled him to help others experience God and to insist that the main task for Jesuits must be the giving of the Exercises as a way of helping people know God's nearness. Ignatius wrote the *Exercises* as a layman; the retreats he directed were a breakthrough for lay people.¹

Many women and other oppressed people today, however, struggle to put their experience, in particular, their view of the human person, in dialogue with the Spiritual Exercises. One of the characteristics of the *Exercises* is its accommodation to different groups and to various needs, for example, the Nineteenth Annotation.

Ignatius lived and wrote in sixteenth-century Spain and Italy, an era marked by the African slave trade, colonial expansion, counter-reform, monarchical rule, military prowess, chivalry, the persecution of Jews and Moors, and the Spanish Inquisition. His interpretation of scripture and his theological world-view were shaped by his cultural setting. These cultural limitations cannot be interpreted today as intentional prejudices. While it is not appropriate to fault Ignatius for his seemingly sexist and military imagery, it is important to assess its impact on people today.

Contemporary theology of the late twentieth century is indebted not only to the development of philosophical theology coming largely from Europe and the writings of Karl Rahner, but also the insights of creation, political, liberation and ecofeminist theologies emanating principally from North and South America, Africa and Asia. These insights include the social and political dimensions of grace and sin, the new story of creation which assumes an emergent view of the universe

and proclaims the interdependence of all creation, and the communal nature of the Church as the pilgrim people of God. Ignatian spirituality can integrate these aspects.

Current understandings of the human person's relationship with God have implications for making and giving the Exercises. As well, there is the appeal to experience as the point of departure for doing spirituality and theology. This has been emphasized in recent writings, notably in the transcendental Thomism of Bernard Lonergan and Rahner.² This article discusses some views of the person that are described in the *Spiritual Exercises* and that need to be critiqued and reinterpreted in the light of contemporary theology; images of the person in relation to self and God, Christ, the Church and the world.

Images of the human person in relationship with oneself and God

According to the Exercises, how are we invited to view ourselves and God? In Ignatius' day, the person was viewed largely as a member of society or of a community. The individual was for the most part neither of societal value nor of religious value, given, for example, monarchy and monasticism. Ignatius brought to the fore the individual's unique relationship with God, for example, by his emphasis on experience, the election and the colloquies.³

Today's holistic view of the human person challenges even the term 'spiritual exercises' as suggesting a dichotomy between spiritual and physical exercises, or between spiritual and psychological exercises. Distinguishing from physical exercises, Ignatius himself described the term 'spiritual exercises' to mean retreat activities that prepare and dispose our soul to remove disordered affections in order to seek and find God's will for the salvation of our soul.⁴ Are these activities only 'spiritual' without a psycho-physical dimension? Do we need to prepare and dispose only our 'soul' or also our body and our psyche for prayer? Are we intent only on the salvation of our soul or also on wholeness and holiness in a larger context? Would we not today call some disordered affections addictions and compulsions?

The purpose of the Exercises, 'to overcome oneself and to order one's life' (Exx 21:1), might be described differently today as accepting oneself and centring one's life on God. The verb 'overcoming' can connote a battle with oneself, a struggle between the forces of good and evil. If we view life as a process of coming to know and love ourselves, others, God and the world, then 'acceptance' and 'centring' are also appropriate terms.

The Principle and Foundation states: 'Human beings are created to praise, reverence, and serve God our Lord, and by means of doing this to

save their souls' (Exx 23:2). Here we have described the experience of our personal relationship with the God who is constantly creating us in the concrete particulars of our deep desires and decisions whereby we come to self-realization.⁵ We see Ignatius' view of freedom wherein the human person is called to freedom, a view that is grounded in the conviction that fundamentally the human person is created by and oriented to the mystery we call God who offers to share with us the divine life through grace. Our acceptance of this offer is already God's gift of accepting us unconditionally.

While this view of the human person fits well with contemporary theology, the Principle and Foundation has phrases that could be problematic, especially if they are read too hastily or in isolation from the rest of Ignatius' thought. To call God 'Lord' in a non-monarchical culture can present difficulties to many, especially for people in the Third World who are trying to be free of the oppression and domination of dictators abusing their trust. While many Christians today want to 'save their souls', they express this desire in other words: harmony and union with self, body, God, others and the world. The documents of Vatican Council II recast this focus, expressing optimism about the universal possibility of salvation. Salvation is not only individual; it is also social and embodied.⁶

As in the *Suscipe*, Ignatius' prayer of surrender (Exx 234:4-5), the initial Exercises of the First Week are meditations using the three powers of the soul: memory, understanding and will (Exx 45, 55, 65). There is a similar use of these powers in the Augustinian triad reflected in Thomistic faculty psychology which is supplemented today in theological anthropology by imagination, consciousness, freedom, the unconscious and affectivity. Yet Ignatius himself was conscious of these other dimensions. Ignatius is famous for prayer of the imagination in the First Week and in his Second Week contemplation of gospel scenes. For example, he described different forms of prayer of the imagination, such as the application of the senses in the Second Week, applying sight, hearing, smell and touch to our contemplation of the incarnation, Jesus' birth and childhood.⁷

Among underlying convictions of the Exercises which can be reinterpreted by contemporary theology, I choose to deal with two formative ones, self-knowledge and freedom. In the Exercises, self-knowledge leads us to knowledge of God. What is the understanding of self-knowledge? The human person in the Exercises is viewed as having memory, understanding, will, imagination and emotions. Today we recognize that knowledge of ourselves also includes a knowledge of ourselves in our

bodiliness, sexuality, dreams, relationality, fantasies, hopes, regrets, fears and commitments. In other words, in so far as we come to know who we are in our individual uniqueness and beauty and to love the self we are before God, then to that extent we come to know the depth and beauty of the incomprehensible mystery of God. Certainly Ignatius' notion of 'soul' includes this very understanding of self.⁸

A second underlying conviction of the Exercises is that human existence is a dialogue between two freedoms, ours and God's. In this sense, according to the Exercises, freedom is understood as the radical decision for God. When the choice is for God, our freedom is affirmed rather than diminished. Understood as this radical desire to change my life to follow Christ, the election is of key importance in an Ignatian retreat.⁹

Furthermore, surrender to God implies growth in freedom. The *Suscipe* addresses the God of human freedom who calls us to be free. The more we surrender to God, the freer we become and the more capable of interdependence with others and God. Some contemporary theologians accept Ignatius' emphasis on freedom.¹⁰

The meditations of the First Week are on sin and hell. The retreatant is invited to beg the grace of shame and confusion for past sin (Exx 48:4). These meditations are meant to throw into relief the human person as sinful. According to Ignatius, both our goodness and our tendency toward guilt need to be converted; our goodness needs to be drawn out of isolation into life-giving relationship. Grace liberates us from sin to love and enables us to participate in divine life. Today theology reflects upon the social dimensions of sin and grace affecting not only interpersonal relationships but also political institutions. Such a reflection is not indicated in the Exercises as such. According to political theology, sin includes such activities as collusion in making profits from exploiting the weak, and redemption means liberation from oppressive structures.¹¹

The second point of the first meditation takes literally the story of Adam having been created first and then Eve having been created from Adam's rib according to the account in Genesis 2:5-25. It goes on to refer to the story of the fall in Genesis 3 in which Eve is portrayed as falling from grace first and then tempting Adam to do likewise (Exx 51:1-6). It does not reflect an emergent concept of creation and may not be adequate for retreatants today.

These accounts must be understood in the light of the culture of the Genesis authors. First, the implication that man was created before woman, that woman was created from man, suggests the view that justifies male dominance and the subordination of women to men.

Second, the statement that Eve ate the forbidden fruit first and talked Adam into doing likewise reinforces the image of woman as temptress, seductress, the one prone to sin and associated with evil. The traditional image of sin as disobedience to God's will portrayed in this account can be complemented with the contemporary image of sin as lack of love, as self-rejection, as alienation from oneself, one's neighbour, nature and the human community. By the same token, the traditional images of grace as ransom, sacrifice, purification and healing need to be complemented today by the contemporary images of grace as forgiveness, change of heart, change in social relationships and in personal life. We need to view sin not so much as proud self-assertion as the passive failure to take responsibility for one's life. We need to approach grace not only as self-sacrificing love but also as transforming presence.¹²

The new story of the origins of our universe describes a first group of human beings evolved from stardust and apes who are both sinful and graced from the beginning, with no primal experience of paradise and no 'fall' from grace. In this view, retreatants can be invited in, for example, the colloquy of Exx 53¹³, to contemplate the brokenness, the sin that is original to the human condition, such as human violence, greed and our rape of the earth.

Each meditation is to conclude with a colloquy with Christ or with a triple colloquy with Mary, Christ and God in the metaphor of Father. In suggesting this method of ending with a colloquy, Ignatius revealed his conviction about the power of life-giving dialogue and the energy of the affections to draw us to communion with a God who is redemptively involved in our history. In other words, growth is dialogical and relational.¹⁴

Ignatius described three ways of being humble in the Second Week (Exx 165–168). The first way is that we lower and humble ourselves in order to be obedient to the law of God in all things. The second way is an indifference to wealth or poverty, honour or dishonour, a long life or a short one. The third way chooses greater identification with Christ by preferring poverty, contempt and a short life. Retreatants may have special difficulty praying over these ways. For too long obedience has meant for many an unhealthy giving up of responsibility for one's life, a submission to the will of the one who holds power and knowledge. Today contemporary theologies emphasize assertiveness and active co-responsibility for one's own life and for the future of our world. What is important to remember, however, is that the Third Mode of Humility assumes a strong sense of self and God.¹⁵

The guidelines for making an election affirm the dignity of human freedom in dialogue with God's freedom (Exx 169–189). Ignatius

distinguished three different ways to recognize a good decision: that could be a time when our will is moved by God in such a way that we know beyond doubt what we are to do; or a time when we gain clarity through the discernment of various spirits; or a time of tranquillity when we are not moved one way or the other and can exercise our faculties peacefully. The first time seems to be a description of a consolation without a preceding cause. Ignatius used the phrase 'consolation without a preceding cause', or consolation without an object, to describe the primary word God speaks to us, the basic experience of orientation to God which reveals God's will for us (Exx 330). This pure consolation is the authentic criterion for other choices we make.

The second time tests the movements going on within us. If no election is made in the first or second time, Ignatius proposed two methods for making an election in the third time. The first method relies on reasoning to weigh the cons and pros; the second method uses the affections and the imagination to get in touch with what would be for the greater glory of God. Notice the delicate balance here between the divine action and human subjectivity. For Ignatius, God can act directly as well as through creatures including all our human faculties.

These guidelines throw into relief that Ignatius urged not only an approach to faith as intellectual conviction and faith as trust in a personal saviour, but also faith in action. Today liberation theologies put special emphasis on this praxis dimension by exploring and embodying the Church's preferential option for the poor.¹⁶

The section on Rules for the Discernment of Spirits fosters learning about God's will through reflection on experience (Exx 313-336). Discernment for Ignatius is a listening to the word of God, and seeking the will of God in one's concrete situation. Through this dialogue with God, we listen to the word of God that we are. We experience ourselves as spoken to by God in our free uniqueness and historicity, and we become hearers of the word of God. We are disposed then to being interiorly moved by the Spirit of God, and dependent as well upon human means to know God's will for us in the concrete particularities of our individual and communal situation.¹⁷

Ignatius used the phrase 'spiritual consolation' to mean any increase of faith, hope and love which leads us to peace and joy (Exx 316:4). It enables us to love creatures in God, not simply in themselves. Spiritual desolation leads us away from faith, hope and love, and leaves us feeling disquiet and turmoil. Ignatius revealed his sensitive awareness of the creative and destructive forces within and around us, both the divine and the demonic. His conviction about the free gift of God's grace is

underlined by his approach to consolation. The ambiguous reality of human freedom may lead us to experience desolation: it may convict us of our negligence, test our willingness to serve without reward, and convince us of our powerlessness to bring about consolation. Whereas psychology might challenge these three reasons, contemporary theology would still grant the possibility of desolation as a call to be sensitive to the action of God in us.¹⁸

The personification of evil in the person of the devil underscores the human tendency to characterize evil in human form. The caricature of the demonic can be problematic. The devil may better be described as a symbol of selfishness, isolation or alienation. Women may take offence at the twelfth rule which compares the devil to a quarrelling woman.¹⁹

Ignatius revealed himself as a true spiritual director by using the phrase 'angel of light' to mean the demonic force disguised as a sure guide, a trickster who uses good means deviously (Exx 332-334). Ignatius urged us to examine the beginning, middle and end of our thought to be sure we are not being deceived and robbed of peace and joy unconsciously. This powerful metaphor of the trickster is meaningful to many today.²⁰

Ignatius' images of the person in relation to the self and to God were based on his faith-experience. The human person is above all oriented to the mystery of God. In this basic orientation, we come to see ourselves as created, sinful, graced through God's forgiving nearness, and redeemed in Christ. The human person is capable of experiencing this God personally. In the dialogue with God we call prayer, we are hearers and bearers of the word.

Images of the human person in relationship with Christ

Ignatius viewed the human person as called to be a disciple of the risen Christ. This discipleship has both an individual and a social dimension. The disciple is to be a witness and a servant proclaiming Christ in and to the Christian community.

The whole notion of discipleship of Jesus needs to be reinterpreted in the light of non-dependent models of relationship that are grounded in love and justice rather than power, that foster mutuality and reciprocity, for example, a community of disciples. By the same token, Jesus' lordship can be affirmed not as our subservience to medieval, monarchical supremacy but as a search for the centre and source of life.²¹

The Second Week begins with the meditation on the Kingdom, the call of the temporal king as paradigmatic of the call of the eternal King (Exx 91-100). What is important here is not to get lost in images of Christ but to share in Christ's mission of healing and transforming love.

In order to understand how the meditation on the Two Standards of Christ and Lucifer invites us to make a personal decision, we need to distinguish between a true call of God and a temptation (Exx 136–148). As retreatants in the 1990s we may at first have trouble making this meditation since banners are not used in battles and wars today. We are familiar, however, with the use of emblems in advertising and in political lobbying among groups, the plethora of buttons, sweatshirts and posters promoting peace, particular products and party candidates. In many parts of our world we are also familiar with military tactics and strategies. We have all experienced violence and alienation. Therefore, we can meditate on the double standards of our world, forces that enhance our dignity as human persons, and those that do not. In this way, we shift the metaphor from a military strategy against enemies to relational strategies for growth in a discipleship of equals.²²

The Third Week invites the retreatant not only to contemplate Jesus in his suffering and death, but to grieve, be moved by compassion (Exx 190–209). Many women and other oppressed people struggle to identify with Jesus in his paschal mystery by putting their experiences of pain and disempowerment in dialogue with his.

The Fourth Week invites us to intimacy and joy with the risen Christ (Exx 218–229). Marginalized people can be strengthened by celebrating with Christ their experiences of liberation. The risen Christ's appearance first to his mother reflects Ignatius' devotion to Mary and conviction that Christ appeared first to a woman. Whether Christ's first appearance was to Mary the mother of Jesus or Mary Magdalene, the significance of the women around Jesus is a helpful note today. We relate to the risen Christ whose personality continues to develop through his encounters with people in every generation.²³

The following of Christ does not mean a literal imitation of Jesus' words and deeds. Affirming the dignity and uniqueness of our human freedom, Ignatius invites us today to allow the inner structure of the life of the human Jesus to be embodied in our personal situations. Coming to terms with our own sinfulness and accepting ourselves and our world as graced in a community of beloved disciples means growing in our personal and communal relationship with Christ, our gradual identification with his way of relating to God and other people. Contemplating Jesus in the gospels can be a mirror experience of our own call to live through, with and in him for the greater glory of God.

Images of the human person in relationship with the Church

The rules for thinking, judging and feeling with the Church represent Ignatius' way of underlining the relational dimension of being human

and the ecclesial dimension of being a Christian. They do not relate to twentieth-century Christians but his conviction concerning our identity as church is important. They can be problematic for Roman Catholics who possess a historical consciousness with regard to the Church as a human institution (Exx 352–370). The terms and views in this section can be potentially offensive to many retreatants who do not share Ignatius' medieval, military world-view. In his view, these guidelines are needed 'to have the genuine attitude which we ought to maintain in the church militant' (Exx 352:1). He means by this the Church on earth. The people of God no longer view the Church as militant; we are, however, still suffering. The backdrop for our spirituality is not only a struggle but a journey, the journey of a pilgrim people home to our God, in the image of Vatican II.²⁴

The first rule for thinking with the Church might cause many theologians and other committed Christians to bristle: 'We ought to keep our minds disposed and ready to be obedient in everything to the true spouse of Christ our Lord, which is our holy mother the hierarchical church' (Exx 353:1). The images of the Church as spouse of Christ, holy mother and hierarchical institution can be particularly cumbersome for women who are trying to find their identity apart from being spouse, mother and member of a society dominated by male patriarchal institutions of oppression. Frequent reception of the sacraments, urged in Exx 354–355, may not be motivating for women members of the Church who are denied ordination and must, therefore, rely on the male clerical celebration of these sacraments, even though they may have in fact experientially celebrated these sacraments in their ministries, for example, with sick and dying patients. The fourth and fifth rules that praise religious life over marriage may not sit well with retreatants who are convinced that the spirituality of the Church of the future is going to be to a great extent a lay apostolic spirituality (Exx 356–357). The next four rules seem dated since they are based on a devotional spirituality that needs to be nourished by a biblical and liturgical spirituality: the veneration of relics, the lighting of candles in churches, fasts on ember days, and vigils (Exx 358–361). This is not to deny the place of devotional spirituality. Rules 10–12 urge positive attitudes toward superiors and toward theology (Exx 362–364). Rules 13–18 discuss matters of doctrine according to the theology of sixteenth-century Spain and, along with the other rules, need to be contextualized in terms of the world and culture of Ignatius' time. Underlying these rules, however, is Ignatius' strong sense of the Church as the pilgrim people of God, the body of Christ evoking loyalty and solidarity.²⁵

Images of the human person in relationship with the world

Creation, for Ignatius, is based on God's gracious desire for self-revelation. He saw everything as a means for seeking, finding and serving God in all things. He did not try to bypass the world or history in concretizing his apostolic spirituality.

At the beginning of the *Exercises*, the Principle and Foundation states: 'The other things on the face of the earth are created for the human beings, to help them in the pursuit of the end for which they are created' (Exx 23:3). This view of creation sees the human person as dominating other creatures. There are other contemporary views that can be taken. One emphasizes our stewardship of other creatures, and another presents the interdependence of all creation.²⁶

One contemporary expression of our embodiment is the term 'spirit in the world' as a way of describing the human person. This phrase reflects the transcendence of the human person and incarnate reality in history and culture. It is a helpful corrective to Aristotle's description of the person as 'rational animal'. And yet it also can screen our bodily reality as human beings.²⁷

At the end of the *Exercises*, the Contemplation to Attain Love starts out as anthropocentric and then becomes cosmocentric, contemplating God's goodness in one's own creation and redemption before contemplating God's lavish presence in all creation. Contemporary creation spirituality, science and ecofeminism emphasize the latter view as a starting point rather than a terminal point so that the focus is on the human person's interdependence with all creation.²⁸

Ignatian mysticism of joy in the world is not a naïve optimism nor a preoccupation with worldly matters: the contemplations express this joy in the combination of indifference and finding God in all things. Indifference for Ignatius is not stoic apathy; it opens one up for availability to God and others. This approach honours both the mystical and the prophetic elements of piety by acceptance and affirmation of the world. It results in the attitude of becoming contemplative in action, *in actione contemplativus*.²⁹

Conclusion

The basic images of the human person that are emphasized in the *Exercises* include the following: the person as created, graced, sinful, redeemed, invited to a personal relationship with Christ based on identification with his paschal mystery, invited to share with others in Christ's mission of love in the world, and freed by grace to grow in union with self, God, others and the world. Current theological approaches to

the human person sketch these basic images in a view that is sensitive to a pluralism of contexts: a theology of creation based on an emergent view which proclaims the interdependence of all in the universe, a balanced theology of incarnation and redemption, political theology, liberation theology and ecofeminist theology.

Today we are invited to accept the new story of creation which affirms our connectedness and communion with the earth. We are challenged by the social and political dimensions of sin, grace and redemption. In particular, we can interpret sin and forgiveness as the effects of oppressive structures on oppressed peoples. We are called to live the Church's preferential option for the poor and oppressed, not only in Latin America but in all parts of our global community. Are we learning to listen to different voices? We reject exclusive patriarchal structures in favour of inclusive interdependence with other people and with the earth.

In these changing times, as a woman of the First World, I feel we need to walk with other people—women, minority groups, youth, people in Third-World countries—in order to know how they can hear and receive the view of the human person in the Exercises. Only then can we be open to the Spirit speaking through the signs of the times who shows us how to live for the greater glory of God.

NOTES

¹ See Rahner, Karl: *Ignatius of Loyola*, tr Rosaleen Ockenden (Toronto, 1979), esp pp 11–16.

² See, for example, Baum, Gregory: 'The Blondelian shift', *Man becoming: God in secular experience* (New York, 1970), pp 1–36; Rahner, K.: 'Experience of self and experience of God', *Theological investigations (TI)* vol 13, tr David Bourke (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1975), pp 122–132; 'The theological dimensions of the question about man', *TI* vol 17, pp 53–70; cf Carr, Anne E.: *The theological method of Karl Rahner* (Missoula, 1977); King, Norman O.: 'The experience of God in the theology of Karl Rahner', *Thought*, 53/209 (June 1978), pp 174–202.

³ See, for example, Evannett, H. Outram: *The spirit of the Counter-Reformation*, ed John Bossy (Notre Dame, 1970), pp 50–51; and Schemel, George J.: 'Hierarchy of values in the Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius', Guelph, September 26, 1992.

⁴ See Loyola, Ignatius of: *The Spiritual Exercises*, tr George E. Ganss, in *Ignatius of Loyola: Spiritual Exercises and selected works*, ed George E. Ganss (New York, 1991), #1, p 121, hereafter cited as *Ignatius*; and *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, tr George E. Ganss (St Louis, 1992), #1:1–4, p 21, and pp 221–222, hereafter cited as *Exx* with the number, or as *SpExComm* for notes. Another inclusive language translation is *The Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius Loyola*, tr Elisabeth Meier Tetlow (Lanham Md., 1987).

⁵ For this insight, I am indebted to Tetlow, Joseph A.: 'The Fundamentum: creation in the principle and foundation', *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits*, 21/4 (September 1989), pp 1–53. Cf Clarke, Thomas E.: 'Ignatian spirituality and the Protestant principle', *The Way Supplement* 68 (Summer 1990), pp 52–61, esp p 61.

⁶ See Rahner, K.: *The priesthood*, tr Edward Quinn (New York, 1973), pp 16–17. See George Ganss' illuminating notes on these phrases which affirm that Ignatius had a personal, non-monarchical

image of God and a holistic, non-dualistic image of the person, in *SpExComm*, pp 146–51, nn 13–19. On the phrase 'God our Lord,' see Ganss' comments in *Ignatius*, pp 372 and 391, and in *SpExComm*, p 150, n 18, and pp 208–209. When Ignatius used 'God our Lord', he was predicating everything he could that promoted God's trinitarian unity. See Cusson, Gilles: *Biblical theology and the Spiritual Exercises*, tr Mary Angela Roduit & George Ganss (St Louis, 1988), p 57, n 32. On the universal possibility of salvation, see, for example, the Decree on ecumenism, *Unitatis redintegratio*, the Declaration on the relationship of the Church to non-Christian religions, *Nostra aetate*, and the Declaration on religious freedom, *Dignitatis humanae*, in *The documents of Vatican II*, ed Walter M. Abbott (New York, 1966).

⁷ See Exx 101–126. See also Exx 65–72, 76; *SpExComm*, p 158, n 49, and pp 163–65, n 66. Let us recall that Ignatius' use of the term 'intellect' included reason and understanding, and 'will' included acts of the affections (Exx 3:1–3). On praying with memories, see, for example, Hassell, David J.: *Radical prayer* (Ramsey NJ, 1984), pp 20–50.

⁸ See *SpExComm*, pp 150–51, n 19 and p 192, n 145.

⁹ See Rahner, K.: *Spiritual Exercises* (New York, 1966), pp 15–16.

¹⁰ For example, on the inverse proportion between freedom and dependence on God, see Rahner, K.: 'On the theology of the incarnation', *Theological investigations* vol 4, tr Kevin Smith (Baltimore, 1966), p 177.

¹¹ See, for example, Soelle, Dorothee: *Political theology* (Philadelphia, 1974), pp 83–107, Baum, G.: 'Critical theology', *Religion and alienation: a theological reading of sociology* (New York, 1975), pp 193–226; McDermott, Brian O.: *What are they saying about the grace of Christ?* (New York, 1984), pp 21–34; and Haight, Roger: 'Sin and grace', *Systematic theology: Roman Catholic perspectives*, ed E. Schüssler Fiorenza and John P. Galvin (Minneapolis, 1991), vol 2, pp 77–141.

¹² See, for example, Saiving, Valerie: 'The human situation: a feminine view', *Womanspirit rising: a feminist reader in religion*, ed Carol P. Christ and Judith Plaskow (San Francisco, 1979), pp 25–42; Plaskow, Judith: *Sex, sin, and grace: women's experience and the theology of Reinhold Niebuhr and Paul Tillich* (Washington DC, 1980), pp 9–50; Ruether, Rosemary Radford: 'Chapter 4. Anthropology: humanity as male and female', *Sexism and God-talk: toward a feminist theology* (Boston, 1983), pp 93–115; Carr, Anne E.: *Transforming grace: Christian tradition and women's experience* (San Francisco, 1988), esp pp 94–214; Soelle, D.: *Thinking about God: an introduction to theology* (Philadelphia, 1990), pp 54–94; *The special nature of women?* ed Anne Carr and Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza (Philadelphia, 1991); and Susan Niditch, 'Genesis' in *The women's Bible commentary*, eds Carol A. Newsom and Sharon H. Ringe (London, 1992), esp pp 12–14. Cf Nelson, James B.: *The intimate connection: male sexuality, masculine spirituality* (Philadelphia, 1988).

¹³ On the new story, see Berry, Thomas: *The dream of the earth* (San Francisco, 1988).

¹⁴ On redemptive immanence, dialogue and communion, see Baum, G.: *Man becoming: God in secular experience* (New York, 1970), pp 37–60.

¹⁵ On women's assertiveness, see, for example, *Women's spirituality: resources for Christian development*, ed Joann Wolski Conn (New York, 1986). On the third mode of humility, see, for example, Hassel, *op. cit.*, pp 158–177.

¹⁶ See Gutierrez, Gustavo: *A theology of liberation* (Maryknoll NY, 1973). Cf Dulles, Avery: 'The meaning of faith considered in relationship to justice', *The faith that does justice*, ed John Haughey (New York, 1977), pp 10–46.

¹⁷ For example, see Rahner, K.: 'Listening to the word', unpublished manuscript, tr Joseph Donceel; 'On the question of a formal existential ethics', *Theological investigations* vol 2 (Baltimore, 1963), pp 217–234; 'Is prayer dialogue with God?', *Christian at the crossroads* (New York, 1975), pp 62–69; and 'The logic of concrete individual knowledge in Ignatius Loyola', *The dynamic element of the Church* (New York, 1964), pp 84–170. On consolation as goal and guarantee of discernment, see Egan, Harvey D.: *The Spiritual Exercises and the Ignatian mystical horizon* (St Louis, 1976), pp 31–65. For a different view, see Toner, Jules A.: *A commentary on St Ignatius' rules for the discernment of spirits* (St Louis, 1982), and *Discerning God's will: Ignatius of Loyola's teaching on Christian decision making* (St Louis: Institute of Jesuit sources, 1991).

¹⁸ On the crucial distinction between spiritual and nonspiritual consolation and desolation, see Ganss, *Ignatius*, p 426, *SpExComm*, pp 192–193, n 148, and Toner, *Commentary*, pp 283–284.

¹⁹ Exx 325:1. Ganss argues that this passage must be kept in the context of the other two comparisons that Ignatius made and does not express his belittling of women. His correspondence and ministry of spiritual direction testify to his positive attitude toward women. See Ganss: *Ignatius*, p 426, n 139, and *Exercises*, p 193, n 151. Cf Fleming, David L.: *The Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius: a literal translation and a contemporary reading* (St Louis, 1978), p 211, where this metaphor is described as 'a spoiled child'. See also *Women religious and Ignatius Loyola: a look into the future* (Chicago, 1992).

²⁰ The trickster is a more ambivalent figure than the devil. See, for example, Jung, Carl G.: 'On the psychology of the trickster-figure', *The archetypes and the collective unconscious*, 2nd ed, tr R. F. C. Hull, Vol 9 of the *Collected works of C. G. Jung* (Princeton NJ, 1969), pp 255–272; Radin, Paul: *The trickster: a study in American Indian mythology* (NY, 1972); Pelton, Robert D.: *The trickster in West Africa: a study of mythic irony and sacred delight* (Berkeley Ca, 1980); Ricketts, Mac Linscott: 'Tricksters', *The encyclopedia of religion*, general editor Mircea Eliade (NY, 1987), 15.45–63.

²¹ On a re-thinking of discipleship, see, for example, Schüssler Fiorenza, Elisabeth: 'Part 2: In memory of her: women's history as the history of the discipleship of equals', *In memory of her: a feminist theological reconstruction of Christian origins* (New York, 1983), pp 97–241; and 'Discipleship and patriarchy: toward a feminist evaluative hermeneutics', *Bread not stone: the challenge of feminist biblical interpretation* (Boston, 1984), pp 65–92.

²² In the lives of the saints which Ignatius read during his recuperation, Jacobus de Voragine's paragraph about Augustine's treatment of the two cities, Jerusalem and Babylon, and their respective leaders, Christ and the devil, is similar to Ignatius' Two Standards, as Ganss observes, *Ignatius*, p 405, n 62, and *SpExComm*, p 167, n 69. On the point about militarism in today's world, see, for example, Welch, Sharon D.: *The feminist ethic of risk* (Minneapolis, 1990). On the decision-character of this meditation, see Rahner, K.: *Spiritual Exercises*, p 169 and *The priesthood*, pp 173–174. On its relational possibilities, see Rosenblatt, Marie-Eloise: 'Women and the Exercises: sin, standards and New Testament texts', *The Way Supplement* 70 (Spring 1991), pp 16–32, and Byrne, Lavinia: 'Women and the Second Week', *The Way Supplement* 74 (Summer 1992), pp 31–39. On its relevance to our cultural situation, see Wickham, John: *The communal exercises: a contemporary version of the Spiritual Exercises in a communal form* (Montreal, 1988), pp 95–103, 256–264.

²³ On Christ's first appearance to Mary, see Exx 218–221, 299. See Ganss' *Ignatius*, p 417, n 105, and *SpExComm*, pp 182–183, n 115, in which he speculates that Ignatius may have taken this idea from Ludolph of Saxony since it is found in ch 70 of his life of Christ. See also Moltmann-Wendel, Elisabeth: *The women around Jesus*, tr Jolin Bowden (New York, 1982). On the empowerment of the poor, see Rosenblatt, Marie-Eloise: 'Women in the passion and resurrection narratives', and Ruffing, Janet and Moser, Theresa: 'An option for women', *The Way Supplement* 74 (Summer 1992), pp 40–53 and 89–100. On the risen Christ's developing personality, see David J. Hassel: 'Jesus Christ changing yesterday, today, and forever', *SSJ*, 24/3 (May 1992), pp 1–29.

²⁴ For example, Gustavo Gutierrez entitled one of his books *We drink from our own wells: the spiritual journey of a people*, tr Matthew J. O'Connell (Maryknoll NY, 1988).

²⁵ For the historical context and nuances of these rules, see Ganss' illuminating points, *Ignatius*, pp 429–432, nn 151–62, and *SpExComm*, pp 197–200, nn 163–74. See also Collins, Mary: 'Women in relation to the institutional church', Address to the LCWR 1991 National Assembly (Albuquerque NM, August 24–28, 1991), pp 1–11.

²⁶ On stewardship, see, for example, Hall, Douglas: *The steward: a biblical symbol come of age* (Grand Rapids Mich., 1990). On interdependence, see, McDonagh, Sean: *To care for the earth* (Santa Fe, New Mexico, 1986); *Spirituality and society: postmodern vision*, ed David Ray Griffin (Albany NY, 1988); *Healing the wounds: the promise of ecofeminism*, ed Judith Plant (Toronto, 1989); and Bowman, Douglas C.: *Beyond the modern mind* (New York, 1990).

²⁷ See Rahner, K.: *Spirit in the world*, tr William V. Dych (New York, 1968).

²⁸ On creation spirituality, see Fox, Matthew: *Original blessing: a primer in creation spirituality* (Santa Fe NM, 1984). On science see, for example, Capra, Fritjof, and Steindl-Rast, David: *Belonging to the universe: explorations on the frontiers of science and spirituality* (San Francisco, 1991). On ecofeminism, see Primavesi, Anne: *From Apocalypse to Genesis: ecology, feminism, and Christianity* (Minneapolis, 1991).

²⁹ See Rahner, K.: 'The Ignatian mysticism of joy in the world', *TI* vol 3, pp 277–93.